

California
Commission on Teacher Credentialing

Meeting of
March 6, 2003

AGENDA ITEM NUMBER: **PREP – 3**

COMMITTEE: **Preparation Standards Committee**

TITLE: **Comparability Studies of the Early Childhood Emphasis, Middle Level Emphasis, and the Crosscultural Language and Academic Development (CLAD) Emphasis Requirements with those of Other States (AB 877-Scott, 2000)**

 X **Action**

 Information

 Report

Strategic Plan Goal(s):

Goal 1: **Promote educational excellence through the preparation and certification of professional educators**

- Sustain high quality standards for the preparation of professional educators

Goal 6: **Provide leadership in exploring multiple, high quality routes to prepare professional educators for California schools**

- Work with education entities to expand the pool of qualified professional educators

Presented By: **Phil Fitch**

Prepared By: _____ **Date:** _____

Phil Fitch, Ed.D.
Consultant, Professional Services Division

Approved By: _____ **Date:** _____

Margaret Olebe, Ph.D.
Administrator, Professional Services Division

Approved By: _____ **Date:** _____

Mary Vixie Sandy
Director, Professional Services Division

Authorized By: _____ **Date:** _____

Dr. Sam W. Swofford
Executive Director

**Comparability Studies of the Early Childhood Emphasis, Middle Level Emphasis, and the
Crosscultural Language and Academic Development (CLAD) Emphasis/Certificate
Requirements of Other States (AB 877-Scott, 2000)**

**Professional Services Division
March 6, 2003**

Executive Summary

The comparability studies of subject matter requirements and of the three emphases or equivalent state programs were authorized by Commission-sponsored legislation (AB 877, Scott, 2000) and have been completed by work contracted with Educational Testing Service (ETS). The Commission entered into a contract with ETS during in March 2001. It calls for seven deliverables due between July 1, 2001 and March 2, 2003. The contract also calls for a review of credential emphasis or equivalent programs in other states pursuant to AB 877 and includes the development of a database of out-of-state teacher credential requirements. AB 877 requires the Commission to contract for periodic reviews of the comparability of out-of-state requirements related to subject matter requirements and credential emphasis or equivalent programs commencing in 2001 with the reviews to be updated every three years. The database of out-of-state teacher credential requirements is being developed in preparation for the next review cycle commencing in 2004.

This agenda item provides the Commission with comparability data for other states' equivalent requirements for Middle Level Emphasis, Early Childhood Emphasis, and Crosscultural Language and Academic Development (CLAD) Emphasis requirements. Also included is the ETS analysis of data from 49 other states and the District of Columbia. That analysis indicates that there are 44 states comparable with California's early childhood emphasis program, 43 states comparable with the middle level emphasis, and 45 states comparable with the CLAD emphasis.

In California, a candidate may complete the CLAD emphasis by completing the requirement for a multiple subject or single subject CLAD emphasis program. In California approximately 90% of the multiple subject programs are also CLAD emphasis programs and over 60% of the single subject programs are CLAD emphasis programs. Other teachers or candidates who desire to attain the CLAD certificate do so by satisfactorily completing the examination for CLAD. ETS found that a large majority of states require both the exam and program completion. Four states require a program only, and ETS found that the programs in those states were comparable with California.

Policy Issue to be Considered

Should the Commission adopt the findings on comparability for the Middle Level emphasis, early childhood emphasis, and CLAD emphasis/certificate requirements of other states contained in this agenda item?

Fiscal Impact Statement

AB 877 (Scott, 2000) appropriated \$350,000 from the General Fund for the purpose of conducting comparability studies of out-of-state teacher credential requirements.

Recommendation

That the Commission adopt the findings of comparability of the Middle Level emphasis, early childhood emphasis, and CLAD emphasis requirements for the various states identified in this item.

**Comparability Studies of the Early Childhood Emphasis, Middle Level
Emphasis, and the Crosscultural Language and Academic Development
(CLAD) Emphasis/Certificate Requirements of other states (AB 877-Scott,
2000)**

**Professional Services Division
March 6, 2003**

Overview

This agenda item provides the Commission with a report on the implementation of AB 877 (Scott, 2000) related to the comparability of credential emphasis or equivalent programs of other states. In March 2001, the Commission authorized the Executive Director to enter into a contract with Educational Testing Service (ETS) located in Princeton, New Jersey, to complete a series of studies of comparability. The contract with ETS calls for seven different contractor deliverables due starting July 1, 2001 and ending March 2, 2003 (see Table 1). The contract has been completed ahead of schedule and electronic files, database, and summary of survey results were received in January 2003.

The Commission-sponsored AB 877 to study those areas that were lacking in comparability in the initial comparability studies conducted pursuant to AB 1620 (Scott, 1998), and to further streamline and facilitate the entry of qualified out-of-state teachers into the teaching profession in California. A Reciprocity Task Force was established to implement AB 1620. Commission actions recommended by the Task Force can be found later in this agenda item. Building on the initial comparability studies of AB 1620, AB 877 requires the Commission to contract for periodic reviews of the comparability of out-of-state requirements related to Subject Matter preparation, and credential emphasis or equivalent programs, commencing in 2001. These reviews are to be updated every three years.

Methodology Used by Contractor

ETS completed a comprehensive review of all multiple and single subject program standards followed by the identification and analysis of additional “factors to consider” for each emphasis area. A side-by-side comparison was then conducted of other states’ standards and requirements with those adopted by the Commission.

Each standard and “factor to consider” was scored separately. These scores were then entered into the standards categories of the Commission approved Standards of Program Quality and Effectiveness for Multiple and Single Subject Credentials-Early Childhood Emphasis, Middle Level Emphasis, CLAD Emphasis.

Below are the major category areas for each credential emphasis program.

Early Childhood Emphasis

Category I: Program Design and Curriculum
with Early Childhood Emphasis.

Category II: Field Experiences with Early
Childhood Emphasis

Category III: Candidate Competence and
Performance with Early Childhood
Emphasis

Middle Level Emphasis

Category I: Program Design and Curriculum
with Middle Level Emphasis

Category II: Early Field Experiences with
Middle Level Emphasis, including the
Teacher's Role as Advisor

Category III: Candidate Competence and
Performance in Middle Level
Emphasis, including Two Fields of
Academic Consideration

CLAD Emphasis

Category I: Program Design and Curriculum
with Emphasis on English Language
Learners

Category II: Field Experiences with
Emphasis on English Language
Learners

Category III: Candidate Competence and
Performance with Emphasis on English
Language Learners Including Language
Content Area Teaching Strategies

Scores were averaged for each category to determine a final average score for each state. The target or criteria used to determine comparability was an 80% match for the standards, for each category, and for the state.

The following table shows information regarding the seven deliverables for the contract with ETS.

Table 1
ETS Contract Schedule

<i>Due Date</i>	<i>Deliverable</i>
1. July 1, 2001	Submit analysis of multiple subject – subject matter and standards comparability, including exam specifications for ten (10) selected states
2. September 1, 2001	Submit analysis of other state multiple subject – subject matter requirements, including exam specifications
3. December 1, 2001	Submit remaining multiple subject – subject matter studies and all remaining single subject – subject matter comparability studies Submit source documents for studies
4. March 31, 2002	Submit analysis documents of the credential emphasis or equivalent programs comparability study with half of the states
5. June 1, 2002	Submit report on the results of the credential emphasis or equivalent programs comparability study with all state data and source documents included
6. December 1, 2002	Submit CD electronic files, state documents and summary of survey results
7. March 2, 2003	Submit complete database
8. March 15, 2003	Contract completed

The next three tables provide information on the number of states, and the match percentage, that are comparable for the Early Childhood Emphasis, Middle Level Emphasis, and CLAD Emphasis.

Table 2
States Comparable-Early Childhood Emphasis (44 Comparable)

State	% Comparable	State	% Comparable	State	% Comparable
Alabama	100	Maine	92	Oregon	100
Alaska	100	Maryland	100	Pennsylvania	100
Arkansas	100	Massachusetts	100	Rhode Island	100
Colorado	100	Michigan	100	South Carolina	100
Connecticut	100	Minnesota	100	South Dakota	100
Washington D.C.	83	Mississippi	100	Tennessee	100
Florida	92	Missouri	100	Texas	100
Georgia	100	Montana	100	Utah	100
Hawaii	100	Nebraska	100	Vermont	100
Idaho	92	Nevada	100	Virginia	100
Illinois	100	New Hampshire	100	Washington	92
Indiana	100	New York	100	West Virginia	92
Iowa	100	North Dakota	100	Wisconsin	100
Kansas	100	Ohio	100	Wyoming	100
Louisiana	100	Oklahoma	100		

*Six states had no comparable credential area

Table 3
States Comparable-Middle Level Emphasis (43 Comparable)

State	% Comparable	State	% Comparable	State	% Comparable
Alabama	100	Louisiana	100	Oklahoma	83
Alaska	92	Maine	92	Oregon	92
Arkansas	92	Massachusetts	92	Pennsylvania	92
Colorado	100	Michigan	100	Rhode Island	92
Connecticut	92	Minnesota	92	South Carolina	92
Washington D.C.	83	Mississippi	92	South Dakota	100
Florida	83	Missouri	83	Tennessee	92
Georgia	100	Montana	92	Texas	92
Hawaii	92	Nebraska	100	Vermont	100
Idaho	83	Nevada	83	Virginia	100
Illinois	83	New Hampshire	92	Washington	92
Indiana	100	New Mexico	92	West Virginia	92
Iowa	100	North Carolina	100	Wyoming	100
Kansas	83	North Dakota	100		
Kentucky	92	Ohio	92		

*Seven states had no comparable credential area

Table 4
States Comparable-CLAD Emphasis, Exams and Programs (45 Comparable)

State	Program Comp	Exam Comp	State	Program Comp	Exam Comp
Alabama	92	100	Mississippi	100	0
Arizona	83	100	Missouri	100	100
Arkansas	100	92	Montana	92	0
Colorado	100	92	Nebraska	100	92
Connecticut	100	100	Nevada	100	83
Delaware	100	100	New Hampshire	100	100
Washington D.C.	83	100	New Jersey	100	83
Florida	100	92	New York	100	100
Georgia	100	100	North Carolina	100	100
Hawaii	100	100	Ohio	100	100
Idaho	100	100	Oregon	100	100
Illinois	100	100	Rhode Island	100	100
Indiana	100	100	South Carolina	100	0
Iowa	100	92	South Dakota	92	83
Kansas	100	100	Tennessee	100	100
Kentucky	100	100	Texas	100	100
Louisiana	100	92	Utah	0	100
Maine	92	92	Vermont	100	100
Maryland	100	100	Virginia	100	100
Massachusetts	83	100	Washington	100	100
Michigan	100	100	West Virginia	92	100
Minnesota	100	100	Wisconsin	100	0
			Wyoming	100	100

*Five states had no comparable credential area

Credential Programs in Other States that are comparable to CLAD, Middle Level Emphasis, and Early Childhood Emphasis

Under the provisions of AB 877 (2000) out-of-state teachers who apply for a basic teaching credential may also apply for CLAD authorization or an emphasis authorization for Middle Level or Early Childhood. It is necessary, however, for the out-of-state applicant to have completed a specific credential program in another state that was determined by the ETS comparability study to be comparable to California regulations. Specific credential programs in other states that were determined to be comparable are identified in Table 5. As an example, a teacher from Colorado who wishes to obtain a CLAD authorization would have to have completed an English as a Second Language program in Colorado, as well as, a basic teaching credential program. Another teacher from Colorado who wishes to obtain an Early Childhood Emphasis authorization in California would have to have completed a basic teaching credential program, and the Colorado Early Childhood Education (ages 0-3) program.

According to the data submitted in the ETS Comparability Study, no state has requirements incorporated into the basic teaching credential that are comparable to the California CLAD requirements. Therefore, as stated earlier, all out-of-state teachers will have to have completed a basic teaching credential program, as well as, one of the state programs identified in Table 5 to obtain an additional authorization in California.

Table 5
State Credentials Related to California CLAD and Emphasis Areas

State	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood	Middle Level
Alabama	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education (P-3)	Middle Level
Alaska		Early Childhood Education	Middle School Education (6-9)
Arizona	English as a Second Language		
Arkansas	ESL P-8; ESL 7-12	Early Childhood Education (P-4)	Middle Childhood English/Social Studies 4-8 Middle Childhood Math/Science 4-8
Colorado	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education (Ages 0-8)	Early Adolescence Education (middle school), ages 11-15
Connecticut	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL) PreK-12	Integrated Early Childhood/Special Education, Nursery-3	Middle Grades
Delaware	English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)		
District of Columbia	English as a Second Language (K-12)	Early Childhood Education (Pre-Kindergarten-Grade 3)	Middle School Education (Grade 4-8)
Florida	English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)	PreKindergarten/Primary Education (age 3 through grade 3)	Middle Grades English (5-9) Middle Grades General Science (5-9) Middle Grades Integrated Curriculum (5-9) Middle Grades Mathematics (5-9) Middle Grades Social Science (5-9)

Georgia	English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)	Early Childhood Education	
Hawaii	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages	Elementary and Early Childhood	Middle School
Idaho	ENL (English as a New Language)	Early Childhood/Early Childhood Special Education Blended (Birth-Grade 3)	English (6-12) Mathematics (6-12) Natural Science (6-12) Physical Science (6-12) Social Studies (6-12)
Illinois	English as a New Language	Early Childhood Education	Middle Grade
Indiana	English as a New Language	Early Childhood	Early Adolescence Generalist
Iowa	ESL (English as a Second Language(K-12)	Prekindergarten through grade 3 Prekindergarten through grade 3, including special education	Middle School
Kansas	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education	Middle Level 5-9
Kentucky	English as a Second Language, All Grades		Middle Grades, 5-9
Louisiana	English as a Second Language	Grades PK-3	Grades 4-8
Maine	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood (K-3)	Middle Level
Maryland	English for Speakers of Other Languages	Early Childhood Education (N-3)	
Massachusetts	English as a Second Language; PreK-8, 5-12	Early Childhood: Teacher of Students with and without Disabilities PreK-2	Middle School 5-8
Michigan	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education	Middle Level
Minnesota	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood/Special Education	Middle School
Mississippi	English as a Second Language K-12	Elementary Education K-3	Elementary Education 4-8

Missouri	English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL)	Early Childhood Birth-Grade 3	Language Arts 5-9 Mathematics 5-9 Science 5-9 Social Science 5-9
Montana	English/Second Language (K-12)	Early Childhood Education	Secondary Level (level 8) [Note: This is the certification level that covers grades 5-12.]
Nebraska	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education	Middle Grades Education
Nevada	English as a Second Language	Birth Through the Second Grade	Grades 5-9
New Hampshire	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood Education N-3	Middle/Junior High School
New Jersey	English as a Second Language		
New Mexico	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages	Early Childhood (B-3)	Middle Level Education (5-9)
New York	English to Speakers of Other Languages (PerK-12) (Teacher of)	Early Childhood Annotation	English (7-9) General Science (7-9) Mathematics (7-9) Sciences (7-9) Social Studies (7-9)
North Carolina	English as a Second Language (grades K-12)		Language Arts (6-9) Mathematics (6-9) Science (6-9) Social Studies (6-9)
North Dakota		Early Childhood Education	Middle School
Ohio	Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages/Bilingual	Early Childhood (PreK-3)	Middle Childhood (4-9)
Oklahoma		Early Childhood Education	Middle Level English Middle Level Science

			Middle Level Social Studies Middle Level/Intermediate Mathematics
Oregon	ESOL/Bilingual	Early Childhood	Middle Level
Pennsylvania		Early Childhood	Middle Level
Rhode Island	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood	Middle School
South Carolina	English as a Second Language – Grades K-12	Early Childhood	Middle Level Language Arts Middle Level Mathematics Middle Level Science Middle Level Social Studies
South Dakota	K-12 English as a New Language	Birth Through Age Eight Early Childhood	5-8 Middle Level
Tennessee	English as a Second Language (ESL) PreK-12	Early Childhood PreK-3	Middle Grade 5-8
Texas	Bilingual Generalist: 4-8 Bilingual Generalist: EC-4	Early Childhood Education Generalist: EC-4	English/Language Arts and Reading/Social Studies: 4-8 English Language Arts and Reading: 4-8 Generalist: 4-8 Mathematics/Science: 4-8 Science: 4-8 Social Studies: 4-8

Utah	ESL	Early Childhood	
Vermont	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood	Middle Grades
Virginia	English as a Second Language	Early/Primary EducationpreK-3	Middle Education 6-8
Washington	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood	Middle Level
West Virginia	English as a Second Language	Early Education	English 5-9 General Science 5-9 Mathematics 5-9 Social Studies 5-9
Wisconsin	English as a Second Language	Early Childhood-EEN (grades PK-K)	
Wyoming	English for Speakers of Other Languages (ESL)	Early Childhood Education	Middle School Grades (5-8)

Previous Actions of the Commission

Regarding AB 1620 (Scott, 1998) and AB 877 (Scott, 2000) Comparability Studies

Data are provided in Table 6 that shows the comparability of various multiple, single and special education credential requirements. Candidates from out-of-state are presently being credentialed under these provisions.

Table 6
Summary of States Determined to be Comparable

Multiple Subject-Subject Matter Requirements	36 States
Single Subject-Subject Matter Requirements	
English	49 States
Math	47 States
Social Science	48 States
Science	
Biological Science	40 States
Chemistry	40 States
Physics	46 States
Geoscience	36 States
Physical Education	40 States
Music	41 States
Art	29 States
Foreign Languages	
French	6 States
Spanish	35 States
Special Education	
Mild-Moderate	31 States
Moderate-Severe	22 States
Low Incidence	
Deaf and Hard-of-Hearing	28 States
Physical and Health Impairments	9 States
Visual Impairments	26 States
Early Childhood Special Education	18 States
Clinical Rehabilitation: Audiology	7 States
Clinical Rehab: Lang., Speech, Hearing	24 States
Clinical Rehab: Orientation and Mobility	1 State

